

| | | |
|---|---|---------------------|
| COMMUNITY SAFETY AND ENVIRONMENT SCRUTINY PANEL | DATE 17 September 2020 | ITEM NO 6 |
| TITLE CCTV In-Depth Scrutiny Review (2019-2020) conclusions | WARD (S) All | |
| CHIEF OFFICER Director of Community Safety & Environment | CABINET MEMBER Community Safety | |

1. Purpose of the Report

The Panel is asked -

- 1.1 To note the evidence gathering undertaken as part of the review, set out in Paragraph 6.
- 1.2 To comment on and agree the recommendations, as set out in paragraph 9
- 1.2 To authorise Councillor Khaireh, as Chair of the Scrutiny Panel, to make final amendments to the report, following this meeting.
- 1.3 To agree to recommend the recommendations of the review be submitted to Overview and Scrutiny.

2. Links to the Royal Greenwich high level objectives

- 2.1 This report relates to the Council's agreed high-level objectives as follows:
 - A Healthier Greenwich
 - A Safer Greenwich
 - A Great Place to Grow Up
 - A Cleaner, Greener Greenwich
 - A Strong Vibrant and Well-run Borough

3. Executive Summary

- 3.1 The overarching aim of deploying CCTV is to reduce social offences and crimes by deterrence, monitoring the scene (reactive surveillance) and detection (proactive surveillance).

- 3.2 The Royal Borough of Greenwich CCTV team comprises 17 operators and one manager. It is one of only seven London Boroughs who have received the surveillance camera commissions third party certification mark and is well-regarded by Royal Borough of Greenwich staff and the Metropolitan Police Service (MPS). It has excellent levels of operation with planned staffing in place continuously and any faults are repaired rapidly. There are growing opportunities for increased revenue such as charging for access requests from insurance companies and great potential for increased Integrated Enforcement activity with new technologies such as the addition of ANPR.
- 3.3 The police view CCTV as a critical tool in their fight against crime and disorder, and that supports their work in a variety of ways. In addition, evidence from intervention studies incorporating an additional outcome measure to recorded crime statistics suggests that CCTV may be more effective in terms of increased crime detection than it is in terms of deterrence, particularly in the case of violent crime. More intelligence surveillance systems using emerging technology could also assist with earlier threat identification and reduce pressure on operators.
- 3.4 The findings of psychological experiments suggest that evidence captured on CCTV may lead to the most successful and reliable outcome in terms of securing a conviction, when circulated in the media, through provoking identification by members of the public familiar with the offender. The extent to which CCTV improves public feelings of safety remains unclear due to conflicting results of prior- and post-intervention surveys. Anecdotal evidence suggests there are many additional benefits of CCTV that go beyond any impact it may have on crime.

4. Background

- 4.1 Scrutiny has responsibility for examining the work of the Council and its partners, in relation to all aspects of service provision.
- 4.2 The In-Depth Scrutiny – Project Statement to review of the Royal Borough of Greenwich CCTV provision was agreed by the Community Safety and Environment Scrutiny Panel at its meeting of 27 June 2019. (Appendix A). The Members who would form part of the review working group were also proposed and agreed at this meeting; Councillors Khaireh, Cousins and Hills. Unfortunately, Council Hills subsequently had to give apologies for attending the evidence gathering meetings.
- 4.3 The main purpose of the review was to consider the CCTV provision in terms of:

- CCTV Control room – working practices and challenges
- Provision of and appropriate positioning of CCTV cameras to meet current and evolving need.
- Financial aspects; income streams, maintenance / renewal costs.
- Partnership working
- Connections with Planning and Arboriculture
- Health & Safety
- Enforcement of Traffic Contraventions by CCTV

4.4 The Members working group conducted several evidence gathering meetings which are referenced in paragraph 6, below

5. Current CCTV Provision

5.1 The CCTV service is an integral part of the Councils Safer Spaces strategy and Integrated Enforcement model.

5.2 The CCTV operative's monitor over 700 cameras located around the Borough's town centres, housing estates, Heritage Sites and the Greenwich/Woolwich Foot Tunnels. Also, the help points located in the tunnels with the lifts feeding live images directly to the CCTV Control Room.

5.3 All CCTV operators are vetted by the Metropolitan Police Vetting Unit – Non-Police Personnel – Level 1, which is completed every 3 years. They are all also Tavcom trained in Surveillance of Open Public Spaces NVQ CRO levels 1 and 2. The CCTV Manager is trained in Tavcom Managing a Control Room NVQ CRO 3 and 4.

5.4 The CCTV Control Room is staffed 24/7, 365 days of the year by at least two members of staff working in 8 ½ hour shifts.

5.5 Between April 2018 and March 2019 the Council CCTV Control Room were responsible for 322 arrests; from March 2019 to February 2020 the CCTV control room have been responsible for 405 arrests.

5.6 The current CCTV equipment maintenance contract expires in 2020. Given the expiration of the maintenance contract and advances in CCTV equipment, the Assistant Director Community Safety & Environment is taking this opportunity to review the current equipment provision and working practises. This review is running alongside the Scrutiny Review and will incorporate the Scrutiny review findings.

6. Review Investigation and Findings

- 6.1 Following a meeting of the member lead working group on 11 July 2019 to establish the remit of the review and proposed lines of enquiry and Initial evidence gathering meeting was arranged for 26 July 2019.
- 6.2 The meeting considered the various aspects of CCTV provision in order to identify the key focus areas of the review. The information provided by officers enabled Members to formulate a programme of activities to gather evidence to conduct the review. (Appendix B)
- 6.3 Members were also presented with details of the number of static CCTV cameras and their locations. Officers informed Members on the logic behind their current locations of CCTV units, to allow Members to understand the complexity of the system.
- 6.4 CCTV Control room – working practices and challenges**
- 6.4.1 The Members working group visited the CCTV Control Room on 23 September 2019.
- 6.4.2 The CCTV Control Room operatives are responsible for answering the Met Radios for the newly formed Borough Command Unit and relaying to Police the types of incidents they are seeing as well as dealing with police enquiries.
- 6.4.3 There is also a radio link, within the CCTV Control Room dedicated to the Town Shop Watch scheme used by the Town Wardens and Town Centre Police, as well as the security guards. The Town Shop Watch radios covering Woolwich and Eltham are in constant use from the security guards regarding assistance with shop lifters.
- 6.4.4 Members were advised that CCTV images are backed up to a main server, securely located in the same building as the Control Room. However, if for any reason the operatives were locked out of the Control Room building there would be no access to the images. A second storage server is proposed to be located in the Woolwich Centre and will be addressed as part of the review the current equipment provision and working practises.
- 6.4.5 Unless there is a specific request from the police or there is a major incident the images recorded by the CCTV are retained for 31 days, after which they are automatically deleted.

6.4.6 The Met Police made 633 requests for copies of recorded images in the period April 2019 to February 2020. These images take, on average, a team member 1 hour to download per camera. When there is a serious crime incident, on average to download onto an external flash drive would take an operator up to 4 hours depending on how many cameras have been requested.

6.4.7 Currently the CCTV Control Room supplies DVD copies of images to Insurers, upon request free of charge. The Control room began monitoring the number of requests in October 2019. Between October 2019 to end of April 2020 170 request were received and 30 DVDs were provided in response to these requests.

6.5 **CCTV cameras**

6.5.1 The location of CCTV Cameras is based on statistical data, at the time of the installation of the system and in line with the code of conduct. The CCTV service seek to annually review the locations as part of their privacy impact assessment processes.

6.5.2 The exact location of CCTV cameras is not published publicly, however the main areas of coverage are the Boroughs Town Centres and identified 'hot spots'.

6.5.3 The current location of CCTV cameras is being considered as part of the Departmental review the current equipment provision and working practises, along with the recommendations of this Scrutiny review, in respects of the Council's use of CCTV.

6.5.4 The CCTV unit is also exploring the possibility to increasing the number of mobile CCTV cameras, which support the investigation of Enviro-crime and wider Integrated Enforcement action. However, any such additional outlay would need to be achieved within the revenue budget.

6.6 **Finances**

6.6.1 Like most other Local Authorities, Greenwich is experiencing financial pressure and whilst other Boroughs have the Royal Borough however remains committed to delivering a modern public CCTV service on a 24/7 basis, 365 days per year whilst keeping running costs within the budget envelope.

- 6.6.2 The CCTV service currently operates with a revenue budget of around £850k per annum with an additional c.£80K budget per annum to maintain cameras stock.
- 6.6.3 The CCTV service is investigating ways offsetting some costs across the wider service area were being considered, specifically the introduction of a new, reasonable fees & charges policy relating to the provision of footage for civil proceedings and insurance claims.
- 6.6.5 The Head of Safer Spaces has undertaken a benchmarking exercise against other Boroughs and recommended that the charging for images to be provided to Insurance companies be brought in. The Council's Legal Department is currently considering this proposal in line with any GDPR implications.

6.7 Partnership Working

Metropolitan Police Service

- 6.7.1 Bexley Council no longer monitoring the CCTV feeds in their Borough. Approaches were made to take on monitoring of their system but was not taken up. There have been some issues with tracking incidents across the Borough boundary, particularly in areas such as Abbey Wood – Wilton Road. The Met Police review the images recorded on the Bexley system on a needs basis.
- 6.7.2 The main operational partnership is with the Metropolitan Police Service and direct radio communication with the Police via the Airwave and Town Centre radio systems is operated within the Control room. This enables communication between the CCTV Control Room, the Metropolitan Police Service Central Command Centre (CCC) and police officers on the ground.
- 6.7.3 It is also possible for the CCTV operative to transmit live CCTV images into the CCC.
- 6.7.4 The CCTV Control room have a service level agreement with the Met Police and close working relationship between Police Officer and CCTV Operators had been established as part of the Police 3 Borough Merger.
- 6.7.5 The Membership working group were concerned that, whilst assured there was an obvious good working relationship, which they did not wish to impeach, they were concerned that the partnership was not equal. They raised concern that, due to the efficient work of the Councils CCTV

operatives the police may be directing more police resources into Lewisham and Bexley Borough, whilst also closing police stations and holding units within the Borough. They were concerned at the pressure this could place on the Councils CCTV provision and operatives.

External Partners

6.7.6 The Royal Borough of Greenwich CCTV Partnership Group meets every four months. It is attended by the Head of Service level or Senior Manager and external partners of organisations who use the Councils CCTV or have significant CCTV coverage themselves.

6.7.7 The aim of the Royal Borough of Greenwich CCTV Partnership Group is to bring together relevant external stakeholders in order to improve information sharing, working relationships and effectiveness of our public space CCTV services. Details in relation to this meeting are set out at appendix C

6.7.8 The first meeting of the Safer Spaces CCTV Partnership Group was scheduled for 2nd April 2020 and then Bi Monthly thereafter. However, due to the coronavirus pandemic, this meeting had been postponed to a date to be confirmed later in the year.

Interdepartmental partners

6.7.9 As part of the launch of Safer Spaces Strategy a Safer Spaces CCTV Steering Group has been established and is scheduled to meet on a Bi Monthly basis. The Safer Spaces CCTV Steering Group is chaired by the Head of Service for Safer Spaces and attended by Head of Service officers or Senior Manager's.

6.7.10 The aim of the aim Safer Spaces CCTV Steering Group is to bring together internal stakeholders in order to maximise the efficiency and effectiveness of our public space CCTV service. Details in relation to this meeting are set out at appendix C

6.7.11 The first meeting of the Safer Spaces CCTV Steering Group was scheduled for 2nd April 2020 and then Bi Monthly thereafter. However, due to the coronavirus pandemic, this meeting had been postponed to a date to be confirmed later in the year.

6.8. Linkages with planning /redevelopment

- 6.8.1 The CCTV Members working group met with the Assistant Director of Planning & Building Control on 10 October 2019, during which a number of issues were identified, including the demolition of buildings which hosted CCTV cameras, without consultation with or notification to the CCTV Control Room. The development and design, including landscaping of new build which damaged CCTV conduits or resulted in the loss of camera sightlines.
- 6.8.2 Members noted the example given of the Woolwich Centre where the landscaping of the new development impacted on the sight line of a camera due to the planting of a tree adjacent to the main entrance doors. Whilst the tree was still small overtime it would completely obscure the CCTV view of the doors and Members could see that, when in leaf, it was already having an impact.
- 6.8.3 Officers accepted that there was a need to find a way of populating the cabling services, such as water, gas and electricity maps provided to developers with details of the CCTV conduits and cabling routes, to ensure developers would avoid damaging the CCTV conduits and cables.
- 6.8.4 Members noted that that a number of Council Departments were routinely consulted on planning applications, but this did not include the CCTV unit. Officers accepted that, whilst the review may result in formal proposals they would start consulting the CCTV unit on major applications and those within the Woolwich, Greenwich and Eltham town centres, as a matter of course.
- 6.8.5 At the final evidence gathering meeting of 5 March 2020, the Head of Services - Safer Spaces advised the Members working group that the CCTV unit was being consulted on a number of proposed developments.
- 6.8.6 The provision of and sharing of information in relation to the location of cameras and infrastructure, such as cabling, that may be directly effective as part of an application was an area that would be looked at more closely as part of the ongoing Departmental review of the CCTV infrastructure. This was an area that the Head of Safer Spaces would work on with the Assistant Director of Planning & Building Control.
- 6.8.7 Members were surprised to learn that large new developments were not required to link into or work with Councils CCTV system or Control Room. Further, that no S106 monies were ring fenced specifically to CCTV provision.

6.9 Arboriculture issues - Trees and vegetation

- 6.9.1 The Members working group met with the Head of Parks Estates and Open Spaces, Senior Engineer Street Trees, Arboriculture Supervisor and Officer on 17 October 2019.
- 6.9.2 Members were made aware of the conflict between supporting the Councils Greener Greenwich objective and support of action to combat the Climate Change with the concerns of camera obstruction by foliage.
- 6.9.3 A number of issues came to light in respect of the sight lines of cameras being obscured by tree foliage, particularly in the summer. However, there were also issues with the lopping and cutting back of trees, which would only promote more vigorous growth. The moving of trees would be financially prohibitive and not in line with the Councils environmental projects.
- 6.9.4 Members accepted that there was a need to balance the Councils priorities to ensure the safety of its residents with its priorities to reduce Carbon and create a green borough.
- 6.9.5 It was felt that there was a need for improved cross departmental working to be established to ensure that any new tree planting or replacement planting would not cause an obstruction to the CCTV sign lines.
- 6.9.6 It was considered that the CCTV unit should be consulted as part of any new landscaping involving tree planting, particularly in the Town Centres and that, as part of an upcoming internal departmental review of the CCTV locations, consideration be given to the appropriate location of the camera.

6.10 Health & Safety

CCTV Control Room Staff Welfare

- 6.10.1 The CCTV Control Room operatives witness extreme incidents of violence, via the monitoring screens, which many would find distressing. This can be both stressful and a traumatic experience and could not be under-estimated. The CCTV control room has an excellent attendance level.
- 6.10.2 All CCTV Operators are provided with training to enable them to better identify the impact of trauma on themselves or their colleagues. The trauma-informed approach is applied to the day to day working of the Control Room

and the CCTV Operators had reported positive feedback on this to the CCTV Manager.

6.10.2 All CCTV operatives have monthly 1-2-1 meetings with the Control room manager, during which any concerns can be identified, pro-active screening for the signs of post-traumatic stress can be undertaken and a plan of action to support the staff member agreed.

6.10.3 Additional training opportunities to improve personal and wider team performance will continue to be explored and a number of additional training opportunities are being identified to support Operatives.

6.10.4 Members note the case of an Operative witnessing an extremely violent incident and, after some time was able to get support through Clinical Supervision. However, this was not budget for and, therefore, difficult to secure.

Other Council Staff

6.10.5 All the CCTV operatives had undertaken trauma-informed training enabling Operators to better understand personal factors and experiences which may underpin criminal and anti-social behaviour. This has enabled Operators to better identify and respond to incidents whilst understand how enforcement and outreach staff are engaging with the individuals to reduce their vulnerability and unacceptable behaviour.

6.10.6 As well as CCTV monitoring, the Safer Spaces CCTV Team also support Council enforcement teams through radio communications and GPS tracking. Other functions undertaken include out of hours alarm monitoring for the Calderwood Car park within Woolwich Town Centre and facilitate contact with members of the public via help points situated in local foot tunnels and other key locations.

6.10.7 The Head of Services – Safer Spaces was working at developing links with other departments, such as Housing, Licensing and enforcement to encourage them to make the CCTV Control room of activities where the control room could assist by monitoring the area the staff were working in.

6.11 Enforcement of Traffic Contraventions by CCTV

6.11.1 Council of 17 July 2019 resolved to adopt the civil enforcement powers granted to the Council by the London Local Authorities and Transport for London Act 2003 relating to moving traffic contraventions from the

Metropolitan Police with effect from 30th December 2019 (“the Appointed Day”).

6.1.1.2 That all moving traffic contraventions including bus lanes and bus stops / bus stands would be enforced and would not be limited to the contraventions listed in the Parking Strategy (appended at Appendix I to the Cabinet report dated 6th December 2017) which defines eleven key objectives.

6.1.1.3 80 sites have been initially identified as enforcement areas, which cover violation of turn restrictions, yellow box and school parking violation hotspots. The scheme will be piloted with 20 sites, distributed across the Brough, and the programme of insulation of the CCTV monitoring units is being finalised with the provider. At this point in time a firm commencement date of initiation of the scheme is not confirmed.

6.1.1.4 The provision of CCTV cameras and issuing of enforcement violation penalty notices will be a stand-alone system with no direct connection to the CCTV Control Room. This position will be reviewed as part of the Departmental review and updating of CCTV cameras and equipment.

7. Direction of travel

7.1 Due to the age of the CCTV equipment and advances in technology the Assistant Director of Community Safety & Environment and Head of Services – safer communities are undertaking a departmental review of the CCTV Service, with the recommendations and findings of the CCTV Scrutiny review have and will feed into.

7.2 The Departmental review is looking at equipment, reviewing camera locations as well as staff rotas, information back up provision and emergency risk control.

7.3 It is anticipated that the new CCTV arrangements, including a revamped Control room and, back up servers would be brought on line Between September and December 2020, dependant on the coronavirus pandemic position.

8. Available Options

8.1 The Scrutiny Panel are recommended to agree the proposals put forward, as a result of the Scrutiny review, to Overview and Scrutiny and Cabinet to be implemented.

- 8.2 The Scrutiny Panel may choose not to accept the recommendations put forward. However, the Panel would need to give reason why it did not wish to accept the results of the review.
- 8.3 The Scrutiny Panel may choose to extend the review. However, the Panel would need to give specific details of the objectives of an extension.

9. Recommendations

- 9.1 That, as part of the Councils Wellbeing for staff policy, CCTV Control room staff be offered Clinical Supervision, as or when required, as part of the Health & Safety support package.
- 9.2 That the Council maximises publicity in regards to the presence of and successful uses of CCTV in assisting with police, wardens, enforcement, environmental services, to deal with crime in the Borough.
- 9.3 That consideration be given to including the provision of CCTV in new developments, where appropriate/possible, through planning condition or funding available through the Council through S106 agreement.
- 9.4 That any major planning development being considered within the Borough and effecting Town Centres, be required to consult with the CCTV designated officer and their comments be given weight.
- 9.5 That the CCTV designated officer be consulted as part of any new tree planting and or landscaping programmes, and their comments given weight.
- 9.6 That the Council, via the CCTV designated officer, continues to maintain and develop close working relationships the Police as well as private partners, including TfL and local developer, to ensure strategic monitoring to enable the use of CCT to the greatest effect in combating crime and promoting community safety.
- 9.7 That the Cabinet Member for Community Safety and Children's services, with the Assistant Director of Community Safety be requested to undertake a review of the equality of the police partnership and service level agreement.
- 9.8 That any income, resulting from the charging for the provision of images to Insurers and the public, be ring fenced to the CCTV Control Room.

9.9 That the Scrutiny Panel accept a report, as part of the 2021-22 work programme to review the CCTV provision and monitor the implementation of the Panel's recommendations and Departmental Review.

10. Cross-Cutting Issues and Implications

| Issue | Implications | Sign-off |
|---|--|--|
| Legal including Human Rights Act | The purpose of this report is to provide the Panel with information and evidence gathered as part of the review of CCTV provision in the borough. No formal decision will be taken. As such, there are no legal implications arising directly from the report. | <i>Azuka Onuorah</i> <i>Head of Legal Services</i> <i>18/08/2020</i> |
| Finance and other resources including procurement implications | There are no financial implications arising directly from the report. | Damon Cook, Director of Finance, 03/09/2020 |
| Equalities | Decision-makers are reminded of the requirement under the Public Sector Equality Duty (s149 of the Equality Act 2010) to have due regard to (i) eliminate unlawful discrimination, harassment, victimisation and other conduct prohibited by the Act, (ii) advance equality of opportunity between people from different groups, and (iii) foster good relations between people from different groups. The decisions recommended through this paper could directly impact on end users. The impact has been analysed and does not vary between groups of people going about their lawful business. | Jean Riddler 10/03/2020 |
| Staffing establishment | There are no direct implications to staffing establishment resulting from this Scrutiny Review | Jean Riddler 10/03/2020 |
| Community safety | (b) Section 17, Crime and Disorder Act 1998 | Assistant Director, Community |

| | | |
|-----------------------------|---|-------------------------------|
| | “17(1) Without prejudice to any other obligation imposed on it, it shall be the duty of each authority to which this section applies to exercise its various functions with due regard to the likely effect of the exercise of those functions on, and the need to do all that it reasonably can to prevent, crime and disorder in its area.” | Safety & Environmental Health |
| Health and wellbeing | It is anticipated that the recommendations of the Scrutiny Review will assist in supporting the living and working Conditions of residents and employees of the Borough. | Jean Riddler 10/03/2020 |

10. Report Appendices

11.1 The following documents are to be published with and form part of the report:

- Appendix A: In-Depth Scrutiny Work – Project Statement.
- Appendix B: Initial evidence gathering meeting notes.
- Appendix C: Internal & External Partners CCTV group meeting details

11. Background Papers

Agenda & Minutes of the Community Safety and Environment Scrutiny Panel meeting of 27 June 2019.

Report Author: Jean Riddler – Corporate Governance Officer
Tel No. 020 8921 5857
Email. jean.riddler@royalgreenwich.gov.uk

Reporting to: Gurdeep Sehmi – Corporate Governance Manager
Tel No. 020 8921 5134
Email. gurdeep.sehmi@royalgreenwich.gov.uk

Chief Officer: Katrina Delaney - Director of Communities and Environment
Tel No. 020 8921 6101
Email. katrina.delaney@royalgreenwich.gov.uk